

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 1

Tuesday, January 23, 2024

The Board convened at 450 N Street, Sacramento, at 10:02 a.m., with Ms. Lieber, Chair, Mr. Gaines, Vice Chair, Mr. Vazquez, and Mr. Schaefer present, Mr. Emran present on behalf of Ms. Cohen, in accordance with Government Code, section 7.9. A quorum was established.

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Mr. Gaines.

Mary Cichetti, Clerk, Board Proceedings, provided guidelines for public participation and other Boardroom procedures.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Ms. Lieber invited persons who wish to address the Board regarding items not on the agenda to come forward, but none provided comment.

CHIEF COUNSEL MATTERS

David Lujan, Attorney, Legal Department, opened the public hearing with introductory remarks and requested the Board's adoption of a proposed amendment to Property Tax Rule 192, *Audit Selection*, to make the rule consistent with Senate Bill (SB) 1498 (Stats. 2018, Ch. 467), which amends section 469 to provide County Assessors flexibility in meeting annual audit requirements ([Exhibit 1.1](#)).

Mary Cichetti, Clerk, Board Proceedings, read into the record written comments from the following:

Hon. Christopher Wilhite, San Bernardino County
Assessor-Recorder-Clerk ([Exhibit 1.2](#))

MOTION: Mr. Vazquez made a motion to adopt the proposed amendment to Property Tax Rule 192 as published. The motion was seconded by Mr. Gaines. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Emran voted yes.

CONSENT AGENDA

MOTION: Mr. Schaefer made a motion to adopt the consent agenda including the Board Meeting Minutes of December 12, 2023, as presented. The motion was seconded by Mr. Vazquez. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Emran voted yes.

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 2

Tuesday, January 23, 2024

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORTS

Yvette M. Stowers, Executive Director, reported on the status of pending and upcoming organizational issues, and a review of the agency's accomplishments in 2023.

MOTION: Mr. Schaefer made a motion to direct the Executive Director to provide a brief written summary of her remarks in advance of each Board Meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Vazquez. The motion was withdrawn.

The Board recessed at 11:00 a.m. and reconvened at 11:12 a.m. with Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Emran present.

Yvette M. Stowers, Executive Director, introduced Asma Ahmad-Asher, Diversity and Inclusion Officer, who presented a report on the operations of the BOE's Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) Program and the Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Office ([Exhibit 1.3](#)).

Lisa Renati, Chief Deputy Director, reported on the status of operational priorities and the BOE budget for the current fiscal year.

Peter Kim, Chief Communications Officer, provided a quarterly report on BOE communications ([Exhibit 1.4](#)).

The Board recessed at 12:05 p.m. and reconvened at 1:08 p.m. with Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, and Mr. Schaefer present, Ms. Cohen present via teleconference.

TAX PROGRAM MATTERS

Jack McCool, Chief, State-Assessed Properties Division, Property Tax Department, presented the following recommendations for changes to values of state-assessed properties discovered on audit:

CVIN, LLC (8151): Audit adjustments of \$99,500,000 Escaped Assessment, \$9,950,000 Penalty, \$19,191,000 Assessment In-lieu of Interest, for 2020 to 2023.

MOTION: Mr. Schaefer made a motion to adopt the audit adjustments as recommended by staff. The motion was seconded by Mr. Vazquez. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Ms. Cohen voted yes.

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 3

Tuesday, January 23, 2024

Jack McCool, Chief, State-Assessed Properties Division, Property Tax Department, presented the following recommendations for 2023 State-Assessed Property Board Roll Changes:

- | | | |
|------|------|---|
| 2023 | 8042 | Paxio, Inc.,
Increase \$253,414 in Unitary Personal Property in Tax Rate Area 000-001 due to Board Processing error. |
| 2023 | 8042 | Paxio, Inc.,
Decrease \$253,414 in Unitary Improvements in Tax Rate Area 000-001 due to Board Processing error. |

MOTION: Mr. Vazquez made a motion to approve corrections to the 2023 Board Roll of State-Assessed Property as recommended by staff. The motion was seconded by Mr. Gaines. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Ms. Cohen voted yes.

Ms. Cohen left the teleconference and Mr. Emran entered the Boardroom on behalf of Ms. Cohen in accordance with Government Code, section 7.9.

BOARD MEMBER MATTERS AND INITIATIVES

Mr. Vazquez presented a proposal to reconvene the Veterans' Exemption, Disabled Veterans' Exemption, and Homeowners' Exemption Board Work Group (BWG) ([Exhibit 1.5](#)).

MOTION: Mr. Vazquez made a motion to reconvene the BWG for a hearing that will not exceed 2 hours on the second day of the February 2024 Board Meeting after the conclusion of the insurance informational hearing. The motion was seconded by Mr. Gaines. The motion passed. Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, and Mr. Emran voted yes; Mr. Schaefer voted no.

The matter of the Board Member Strategic Plan was deferred to a later date.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORTS (CONTINUED)

Lisa Thompson, Taxpayers' Rights Advocate, provided an update on the workload of the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate Office ([Exhibit 1.6](#)).

2024 MINUTES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

Page 4

Tuesday, January 23, 2024

Henry D. Nanjo, Chief Counsel, provided a quarterly report on the Legal Department's workload ([Exhibit 1.7](#)).

The Board recessed at 1:51 p.m. and reconvened at 2:01 p.m. with Ms. Lieber, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer, and Mr. Emran present.

David Yeung, Deputy Director, Property Tax Department, reported on the status of pending and upcoming projects, activities, and departmental issues, including a quarterly report on Assessment Practices Surveys and an update on the Welfare Exemption Program. Mr. Yeung announced the newly implemented reorganization of the Property Tax Department, which moved the Assessment Practices Survey Program from the County-Assessed Properties Division to a new, separate division, and acknowledged the appointments of the new Chiefs of those two divisions: Lauren Keach, Chief, County-Assessed Properties Division; and Holly Cooper, Chief, Assessment Practices Survey Division.

Glenna Schultz, Principal Property Appraiser, County-Assessed Properties Division, reported on the status of Letters to Assessors ([Exhibit 1.8](#)), and the Appraisal Training and Certification Program.

Jack McCool, Chief, State-Assessed Properties Division, reported on the status of pending and upcoming projects and activities for the Division.

Laurel Williams, Technical Advisor for Special Taxes, provided a quarterly report regarding the Special Taxes workload.

Ted Angelo, Chief, Legislative, Research & Statistics Division, provided an update on administrative and program related legislative bills impacting the BOE.

CLOSING

The Board adjourned at 2:52 p.m.

The foregoing minutes are adopted by the Board on February 21, 2024.