

Tuesday, December 17, 2019

The Board met at its offices at 450 N Street, Sacramento, at 10:03 a.m., with Ms. Cohen, Chair, Mr. Vazquez, Vice Chair, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Yee present,

### PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Ms. Cohen.

### LEGAL APPEALS PROPERTY TAXES NONAPPEARANCE MATTERS, ADJUDICATORY

#### Petitions for Reassessment of Unitary Value

GTT Americas, LLC (8143), 1063180

2019, \$6,230,000.00 Unitary Value

Considered by the Board: Presented for Separate Discussion

Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: No contribution disclosure forms were filed. The Members noted that their records disclosed no contributions from this taxpayer, their agent, or participants.

Action: Upon motion of Mr. Vazquez, seconded by Mr. Gaines and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Yee voting yes, the Board ordered that the petition be denied as recommended by the Appeals Attorney.

Mr. Schaefer stated that he would not participate in the matter of *Frontier California, Inc. (201), 1063284*, in accordance with Government Code section 87105, and left the Boardroom.

Frontier California, Inc. (201), 1063284

2019, \$2,270,200,000.00 Unitary Value

Considered by the Board: Presented for Separate Discussion

Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: None were disclosed.

Action: Upon motion of Mr. Vazquez, seconded by Mr. Gaines and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines and Ms. Yee voting yes, Mr. Schaefer absent and not participating in accordance with Government Code section 87105, the Board ordered that the petition be granted in part, and the value be reduced to \$2,232,900,000.00 as recommended by the Appeals Attorney.

Mr. Schaefer returned to the Boardroom.

Pacific Pipeline System, LLC (486), 1063221

2019, \$71,200,000.00 Unitary Value

Considered by the Board: Presented for Separate Discussion

Contribution Disclosures pursuant to Government Code section 15626: No contribution disclosure forms were filed. The Members noted that their records disclosed no contributions from this taxpayer, their agent, or participants.

Action: Upon motion of Mr. Gaines, seconded by Mr. Vazquez and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Yee voting yes, the Board ordered that the petition be granted in part and the value be reduced to \$38,600,000.00 as recommended by the Appeals Attorney.

Tuesday, December 17, 2019

**PROPERTY TAX MATTERS, OTHER—NOT SUBJECT TO CONTRIBUTION  
DISCLOSURE STATUTE****Audits**

## Plumas-Sierra Rural Electric Cooperative (176)

2016 to 2019, \$2,900,000.00 Escaped Assessment, \$290,000.00 Penalty, \$525,000.00 In-lieu Interest

Action: Upon motion of Mr. Vazquez, seconded by Mr. Schaefer and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Yee voting yes, the Board adopted the audit adjustments as recommended by staff.

**Board Roll Changes**

## 2018 State-Assessed Property Rolls

Action: Upon motion of Mr. Vazquez, seconded by Mr. Gaines and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Yee voting yes, the Board approved corrections to the 2018 Board Rolls of State-Assessed Property as recommended by staff ([Exhibit 12.7](#)).

Exhibits to these minutes are incorporated by reference.

**ADMINISTRATIVE SESSION****Administrative Matters, Consent**

With respect to the Administrative Matters, Consent Agenda, upon a single motion of Mr. Vazquez, seconded by Mr. Schaefer and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Yee voting yes, the Board made the following order:

Action: Approve the Board Meeting Minutes of November 19-20, 2019.

Ms. Yee left the Boardroom and Ms. Stowers entered on behalf of Ms. Yee in accordance with Government Code section 7.9.

With respect to the Administrative Matters, Consent Agenda, upon a single motion of Mr. Vazquez, seconded by Mr. Gaines and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board made the following order:

Action: Approve the 2020 revision of Assessors' Handbook Section 531, *Residential Building Costs*, as recommended by staff ([Exhibit 12.8](#)).

**Tuesday, December 17, 2019**

With respect to the Administrative Matters, Consent Agenda, upon a single motion of Mr. Vazquez, seconded by Ms. Stowers and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board made the following order:

Action: Approve the 2020 revision of Assessors' Handbook Section 534, *Rural Building Costs*, as recommended by staff ([Exhibit 12.9](#)).

With respect to the Administrative Matters, Consent Agenda, upon a single motion of Mr. Vazquez, seconded by Mr. Schaefer and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Stowers voting yes, the Board made the following order:

Action: Approve the 2020 revision of Assessors' Handbook Section 581, *Equipment and Fixtures Index, Percent Good and Valuation Factors*, as recommended by staff ([Exhibit 12.10](#)).

### **Executive Director's Report**

Brenda Fleming, Executive Director, provided a report regarding the status of pending and upcoming organizational issues ([Exhibit 12.11](#)).

Brenda Fleming, Executive Director, reported on Statewide Informational Hearings scheduling and Board meeting location options for discussion and possible action. Ms. Fleming reflected on 2019 accomplishments.

Mr. Gaines asked for clarification on the process by which the Chair and Vice-Chair would rotate according to existing Board approved policy.

Brenda Fleming, Executive Director, introduced Lisa Thompson, Taxpayers' Rights Advocate, who provided the Taxpayers' Rights Advocate monthly update.

### **Property Tax Deputy Director's Report**

David Yeung, Deputy Director, Property Tax Department, introduced Ricard Schwarting, Manager, Tax Area Services Section (TASS), Property Tax Department, who provided an overview of the functions and responsibilities of the TASS ([Exhibit 12.12](#)).

### **Legislative, Research & Statistics Division Chief's Report**

Mark Durham, Chief, Legislative, Research & Statistics Division, provided a review of the agency's legislative proposals for the 2020 Legislative Session ([Exhibit 12.13](#)).

Action: Upon motion of Ms. Cohen, seconded by Ms. Stowers and unanimously carried, Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Stowers voting yes, Mr. Gaines absent, the Board approved the legislative proposals to be supported by the Board of Equalization.

The Board recessed at 11:46 a.m. and reconvened at 12:54 p.m. with Ms. Cohen, Mr. Vazquez, Mr. Gaines, Mr. Schaefer and Ms. Stowers present.

Tuesday, December 17, 2019

**BOARD MEMBER REQUESTED MATTERS****Public Testimony on Property Tax Exemptions to Spur Affordable Housing Development in California (Ms. Cohen)**

Ms. Cohen made introductory remarks regarding public testimony on a review of property tax exemptions to spur affordable housing development in California.

Speaker: Marina Wiant, Vice President of Government Affairs, California Housing Consortium

**Year End Review: 2019 Highlights (Ms. Cohen)**

Ms. Cohen provided an overview of the Board's accomplishments in 2019.

**PUBLIC COMMENT ON MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA**

Ms. Cohen invited persons who wish to address the Board regarding items not on the agenda to come forward, but there were none.

**CLOSING**

The Board adjourned at 1:52 p.m.

*The foregoing minutes are adopted by the Board on January 28, 2020.*

Note: The following matters were removed from the calendar prior to the meeting: *San Diego & Imperial Valley Railroad Company (865), 1063361; California Northern Railroad (810), 1063290; and, Ventura County Railroad Company (812), 1063300.*